

# 2017 Namibia Internet Governance Forum

Shape your digital future Safari Court Hotel and Conference Centre Windhoek, NAMIBIA, 27 – 28 September 2017

AMIBIA

#### PUBLISHED BY

Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF) Website: http://namibia.intgovforum.org/

#### **REALISED WITH THE SUPPORT OF**

ACTION Namibia Coalition African Network Information Centre Fesmedia Africa IGF Support Association Internet Society Namibia Chapter Ministry of Information and Communication Technology Namibia Media Trust Telecom Namibia UNESCO Windhoek Country Office

REPORTING Jennifer Ido

**EDITING** Frederico Links

**COVER DESIGN AND LAYOUT** Zoé Titus













Windhoek Office









# Content

### DAY 1: 27 SEPTEMBER 2017

#### FOREWORD AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

#### **OPENING SESSION: DAY I**

05

Remarks by Kiki Gbeho United Nations Resident Coordinator Remarks by Cecila Mamelodi-Onyadile Senior Programmes Officer, Communications & IT, SADC Secretariat Keynote address by Tjekero Tweya Minister of Information and Communication Technology

#### SESSION I: THE INTERNET AS A MEDIUM TO ACHIEVE INCLUSIVE AND SUSTAINABLE SOCIAL, CULTURAL AND POLITICAL DEVELOPMENT

Moderator: Zoé Titus Namibia Media Trust / ACTION Coalition Eileen Rakow Director of the Office of the Ombudsman Dr. Jean-Pierre Ilboudo Head of the UNESCO Windhoek Office and UNESCO Representative to Namibia

Welcome by Frederico Links Chairperson, Namibia Internet Governance Forum

Elizabeth Ujarura Kamutuezu Acting Deputy Director: IPRM, Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (MICT)

## SESSION II: THE ROLE OF THE INTERNET IN ACHIEVING YOUTH EMPOWERMENT IN NAMIBIA

Moderator: Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia) Lot Ndamanomhata Board Member of the National Youth Council / Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare Eben Haihambo Head of Digital Marketing, New Media Admarketing Gabriel Nhinda Lecturer, University of Namibia (UNAM) / ISOC Namibia Patrine Henock Team Namibia/Namibia Women in Encryption

14

#### SESSION III: WOMEN, GIRLS AND THE INTERNET Moderator: Natasha Tibinyane ACTION Coalition Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia) Alisa Amupolo CEO of PowerCom Emma Teofelus Youth Activist / Law Student Vida de Voss Director of Sister Namibia

Betty Sibeso Editor of Monochrome



#### SESSION IV: GROWING THE NAMIBIAN DIGITAL ECONOMY

Moderator: Graham Hopwood Director of the Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR) Bob Ochieng Stakeholder Engagement Manager, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) Sepo Lamaswala Haihambo RMB Namibia/ First National Bank (FNB) Tatenda Malunga Business Analyst, Green Enterprise Solutions **16 18** 

#### **SESSION V: CYBERSECURITY IN THE NAMIBIAN CONTEXT**

Moderator: Max Weylandt Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR)

Chief Inspector Ratjindua Tjivikua NamPol Cybercrime Unit

Dr. Paulus Sheetekela University of Namibia (UNAM)

Dr. Fungai Bhunu Shava Namibia University of Science and Technology (NUST)

Frederico Links ACTION Coalition

## FILM LAUNCH EVENT: "IMPLEMENTING ACCESS TO INFORMATION IN AFRICA: MOVING FORWARD TOGETHER."

## OPENING SESSION: DAY II (INTERNATIONAL DAY FOR UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO INFORMATION

| 1 | g |
|---|---|
|   |   |

#### **OPENING SESSION**

Message from Ms Irina Bokova Director-General of UNESCO on the occasion of the International Day for Universal Access to Information, delivered by Dr. Jean Pierre Ilboudo, UNESCO Representative to Namibia

Keynote address by John Walters Ombudsman of Namibia

Launch of MISA 2017 Transparency Report by Natasha Tibinyane MISA Namibia / ACTION Coalition



#### **SESSION VI: ACCESS AND AFFORDABILITY**

Moderator: Professor Nixon Ochara Professor in the Department of Informatics, NUST Anna Amoomo Internet Society (ISOC) Namibia Chapter, Student Ndahelekwa Paulus Internet Society (ISOC) Namibia Chapter, Office of the Prime Minister Melvin Angula Head of Universal Access and Services at the Communications Regulatory Authority of Namibia (CRAN)

#### SESSION VII: IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF MULTISTAKEHOLDERISM IN INTERNET GOVERNANCE PROCESSES IN NAMIBIA

Moderator: Eberhard Lisse Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia)

Honourable Faustina Caley Member of Parliament

Elizabeth Ujarura Kamutuezu Deputy Director of IPRM, the Ministry of Information & Communication Technology (MICT) Frederico Links ACTION Coalition

Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia)



#### BUSINESS SESSION: THE FUTURE AND THE NATURE OF THE #NamIGF

Moderator: Bob Ochieng Stakeholder Engagement Manager, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names & Numbers (ICANN)

Frederico Links Chairperson, Namibia Internet Governance Forum

#### **FINANCIAL REPORT**

## FOREWORD AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Getting the Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF) off the ground was undoubtably a rewarding experience for all those involved, since processes were initiated in the second half of 2016.

From the beginning attempts were made to live up to the ideal of having the NamIGF be the product and culmination of a thoroughly multi-stakeholder process. Alas, this proved more elusive than envisaged, even though we can still credibly claim that a large measure of multi-stakeholderism was attained throughout the processes leading up to 27 September 2017.

At the end of the day, though, multi-stakeholderism still largely remains an ideal to pursue, even more so in the wake of NamIGF than in its run-up.

That said, NamIGF was always envisaged as the platform to finally stimulate much needed, broad-based discussion around very pressing policy and socio-economic issues around the Namibian Internet. This has been successfully achieved, and can only go from strength to strength from the launch pad created in 2017.

Ultimately, it is our hope that the Namibia Internet Governance Forum will, and should, become the platform from which Namibia's voice will with increasing assertiveness be transmitted into the regional and global Internet governance spheres. The first steps have now been taken and it remains for us to build the momentum as we journey forward across the Internet governance landscape.

Against this backdrop, it is necessary and appropriate to recognise those who have enabled the emergence of the NamIGF.

Here I'd like to especially single out the following organisations and associations: The Access to Information in Namibia (ACTION) Coalition (for providing the guiding backbone of NamIGF); Fesmedia Africa (for the indispensable financial and material support); the Namibia Media Trust (for material and logistical support); the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (for its supportive partnership); the IGF Support Association and the African Network Information Centre (for their highly appreciated financial assistance); Telecom Namibia (for its technical support); the Internet Society Namibia Chapter and the UNESCO country office (for being there when needed most); and the IGF Secretariat (for its advice and guidance).

And finally, we wish to acknowledge the IGF Academy, of Germany-based online human rights promoter iRights, and the Association for Progressive Communications (APC) for assisting us in taking the very first steps on what initially appeared a very daunting Internet governance landscape.

With that said, we'll see you all again in 2018!

Frederico Links Chair: Namibia Internet Governance Forum

December 2017

Ultimately, it is our hope that the Namibia Internet Governance Forum will, and should, become the platform from which Namibia's voice will with increasing assertiveness be transmitted into the regional and global Internet governance spheres



## **OPENING SESSION: DAY I**

#### Welcome by Frederico Links

#### Chairperson of the Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF)

rederico Links noted that this is the first Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF), 27 September 2017, therefore marks a monumental moment for all people involved in the process. He stressed that the NamIGF is a multistakeholder gathering aimed at providing an inclusive platform for addressing issues that affect Namibia, specifically in terms of the Internet.

Links stated that the first NamIGF comes at the right time: "It is about time that Namibia and Africa escalate their voices in this space (...) at the global level, very often we find ourselves not represented in discussions. (...) It is important that we start discussions at the national and regional levels and afterwards continue to take our concerns and interests to the global level. That is the aim of this Internet Governance Forum."

The dates of this event have deliberately been set to coincide with 28 September, the International Day of Universal Access to Information (IDUAI), as freedom of information is vital for effective Internet governance as well as for Namibia, its government, and the organisations involved in this event (including UNESCO, which in 2015 declared 28 September as IDUAI through its General Conference, adopting Resolution 38C/70).

Links ended his opening remarks, stating his hopes that participants will be able to broaden their understanding and knowledge during the two-day conference and will be encouraged to further the message about Internet governance, its meaning and what can and should be done in this space. "The Internet governance space is a space of active participation and the floor is open for everyone to actively contribute to discussions. As the Internet is a lively space, this platform should be used to put the issues and concerns that participants have regarding their specific backgrounds, sectors and fields on record."

Following the NamIGF, the conference report will be submitted to the IGF Secretariat in Geneva with the aim of achieving official accreditation for Namibia from the UN body.

In conclusion, Links thanked all the partners including, fesmedia Africa of the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, the Namibia Media Trust (NMT), and the African Network Information Centre (AFRINIC), the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (MICT), the Namibia Chapter of the Internet Society (ISOC), UNE-SCO Windhoek Office, Telecom Namibia and the Internet Governance Forum Support Association (IGFSA).

#### Kiki Gbeho United Nations Resident Coordinator

iki Gbeho started with congratulating Namibia on hosting its first ever Internet Governance Forum (IGF) focused on fostering discussion on Internet governance in a bottom-up inclusive manner. She noted that Internet governance allows for the development of policies and mechanisms under which stakeholders discuss and make decisions about the Internet.

"Forums like this allow issues to emerge; issues that not only strengthen local governance, but also allow participation in the international Internet governance debate." Pertinent matters include the topic of net neutrality: allowing for "access to information we want, the way we want it," on the Internet; and whether "bad access trumps no access."

In 2015, the world agreed to a new set of ambitious goals aimed at changing the world for the better, set to be achieved by 2030. The 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of the United Nations Agenda 2030 are intended to help eradicate poverty, ensure environmental sustainability and prosperity for all.

27 September 2017 marks a monumental moment for Namibia and all people involved

in the NamIGF

process

Namibia itself has declared a 'War on Poverty', with the National Development Plan, the Harambee Prosperity Plan and the Poverty Blueprint, which all speak to "accelerate development and ensure no one is left behind."

A well-governed Internet is a critical ingredient to our common goal: a quest to industrialise Namibia through the work of a healthy and educated people

Access to information is vital in improving the public's understanding of current and emerging development issues. Freedom of information also positively affects transparency and accountability by facilitating dialogue between decision-makers and the rest of society. The Internet as an information resource and Information and Communications Technologies (ICTs) as a means to easily, swiftly and widely disseminate information have the potential to help overcome the information divide and further the free flow of information.

Millions of people in low-income countries still depend on public venues for computer and Internet access, despite the global proliferation of mobile phones and home computers.

According to the International Telecommunication Union, in Africa almost 75% are offline, while Internet penetration rates are approximately 35% as compared to 80% penetration in Europe.

Gbeho concluded with highlighting that "a well-governed Internet is a critical ingredient to our common goal: a quest to industrialise Namibia through the work of a healthy and educated people, a Namibia where the war against poverty is won, a Namibia where no one feels left out."

#### Cecilia Mamelodi-Onyadile

## Senior Programmes Officer for Communication and ICT SADC Secretariat

ecilia Mamelodi-Onyadile started with pointing out that the SADC Secretariat wishes to thank Namibia for the initiative and for having invited SADC to officiate this opening ceremony. Namibia is taking a step that SADC as a regional body has envisioned. The regional IGF was set up six years ago, with the first SADC Internet Governance Forum being held in Johannesburg in 2012. SADC called on its member states to hold their own national IGFs, and Namibia on this day becomes the sixth SADC country to convene a national IGF, making this a crucial step feeding into the regional and continental IGFs.

"The Internet is a very important component in our lives. It is changing the way we do things and is introducing new challenges and new dynamics." Cybersecurity is an area of increasing concern in African and SADC is working on addressing cybersecurity issues. Providing people with access to information is vital but "over and above providing access, we also need to provide security to our citizens who are accessing this particular information." There are several SADC initiatives to guarantee increased access to information and SADC is rolling out national Internet exchange points to ensure that the data that is transmitted in the region, remains in the region and therefore reduces the cost of access (one of the key issues SADC is dealing with).

The NamIGF will provide a forum to discuss key issues, and those discussions can feed into the continental IGF in order for the voices of SADC member states, including Namibia, to be heard at this level.

#### Keynote Address: Honourable Tjekero Tweya Minister of Information and Communication Technology, Namibia

Where the people living in rural areas." Namibian statistics are "even more shocking" with approximately 13% Internet connectivity; with many schools, health clinics and businesses left out. Thus, harnessing the potential of ICTs, for instance through e-governance, would only benefit a handful of the population.

The Internet has become an increasingly important platform for communication, locally, globally, personally and professionally, as well as a platform for meaningful political, social and economic engagement.

With the Internet having become such a crucial infrastructure, questions as to how, why and by whom the Internet should be governed are more pertinent. Despite their seemingly divergent interests and perspectives, policy makers, economic stakeholders and civil society advocates alike, all have a stake in the Internet. This makes the Internet a multistakeholder platform which is the principle that should underpin Internet

governance processes on the national, regional and global level.

"I am pleased that Namibia adopted a multistakeholder approach which is a legitimate, transparent and open process to all participants and consciously includes a diversity of stakeholders from industries, civil society, government, technical experts and the academic communities." Sustainable development must be inclusive; all citizens must participate to achieve real progress.

In 2014, SADC urged member states to establish their national IGFs by June 2015. While this was not achieved, "today we can say that the NamIGF is finally a reality."

Honourable Minister Tweya continued to underline that the first ever NamIGF will produce and establish common understanding as well as articulate common positions and proposals on Internet governance from the Namibian perspective. He therefore hopes that pertinent issues will be discussed, especially with the goal of reaching a common understanding on how to balance security and privacy online.

The global Internet governance space is still largely dominated by the global north, it therefore becomes imperative to include the perspectives and interests of small, developing countries, such as Namibia, in the discussions to be able to protect national interests. "Namibia must have its voice heard."

The NamIGF theme: "Shape Your Digital Future" is in line with Namibia's stated developmental objectives. Namibia endeavours to become a developed country and a knowledge-based economy through Vision 2030. To this end, Government has initiated the roll out of e-governance platforms across strategic state sectors and departments, and the review of ICT-related laws and policies with the aim of establishing appropriate legal frameworks for achieving the country's digital goals. Additionally, the Namibian Government continues to heavily invest in ICT infrastructure, locally, nationally and regionally, and provides computers to schools and youth and community centres around the country to increase citizens' access to the Internet.

Access to Information to further government transparency and accountability has been embraced by the Namibian Government and has therefore been explicitly articulated in the country's Harambee Prosperity Plan. Namibia is also a signatory to the 17 SDGs, of which SDG 16 recognised the importance of access to information for achieving sustainable development.

Agreeing that access to information is a developmental imperative, the Namibian Government, through the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (MICT), remains committed to ensuring access to information to all citizens. The Access to Information Bill is currently being finalised for tabling in Parliament in the near future. The Bill has undergone a comprehensive and inclusive consultation process, including consultations with rural communities from all areas.

Honourable Tjekero Tweya concluded his remarks with declaring the NamIGF officially opened and ready to serve Namibia and Namibian interests.

Despite their seemingly divergent interests and perspectives, policy makers, economic stakeholders and civil society advocates alike, all have a stake in the

Internet

Namibia must have its voice heard in the international Internet Governance arena

# SESSION I: The Internet as a medium to achieve inclusive and sustainable social, cultural and political development

Moderator: Zoé Titus Namibia Media Trust (NMT) / ACTION Coalition

Scene setting session. ICTs can be key enablers of development across all pillars of sustainable development. The panel discussed what factors can influence and promote sustainable and inclusive growth when leveraging ICTs for development, as well as share experiences on policies and capacity building initiatives that have helped promote inclusivity when leveraging the Internet to enable sustainable development. The panel discussed what challenges to inclusion and sustainable development need to be addressed to try and achieve the SDGs, and the policy approaches necessary.

#### Eileen Rakow Director of the Office of the Ombudsman

Eileen Rakow explained that from a human rights perspective, sustainable development means inclusive growth without leaving anyone behind. Sustainable development cannot happen without involving marginalised groups, especially those that lack access to human rights and access to basic services.

"There is a disconnect between what we as a country promise, and what is being done in practice." Good ideas are being expressed as to how to achieve truly inclusive development, considering the needs of diverse groups and facilitating their participation in the process.

The Internet can be used as a tool for access to justice, "today it is a breeze to conduct legal research, as you can get all judgements electronically" and laws can also be obtained online, e.g. through the database of the Legal Assistance Centre (LAC).

#### Dr. Jean-Pierre Ilboudo

Head of the UNESCO Windhoek Office and UNESCO Representative to Namibia

Dr. Jean Pierre Ilboudo noted that UNESCO has taken on the mandate to promote awareness of the SDGs at the global and national levels. It is therefore pertinent that UNESCO collaborates with governments and local stakeholders to effectively domesticate the SDGs on the national level. In Namibia, the United Nations (UN) and the Namibian Government, together launched the 'Domestication of Sustainable Development Goals and Africa Agenda 2063' - global and continental goals set out to achieve sustainable development.

"In the Namibian context, it is crucial that the youth and journalists are educated about the SDGs," stressed Dr. Ilboudo. These two groups will be able to widely raise awareness about and promote the SDGs, which is vital for the successful realisation of the goals. Additionally, gender inequality needs to be addressed, as women play an important role - they "produce 80 percent of the economy in Africa."

Information related to SDGs is shared in indigenous languages via radio programmes and other mediums, for this information should be accessible to all in a comprehensive and usable format.

Community multipurpose centres should be a link between community radios and the Internet, allowing for information and content to be shared through diverse channels and bridging the information divide between rural and urban residents.

Finally, teaching journalism for sustainable development, a global initiative spearheaded by UNESCO, equips journalists with the tools to support the implementation of the SDGs.

Sustainable development cannot happen without involving marginalised groups, especially those that lack access to human rights and access to basic services

#### Elizabeth Ujarura Kamutuezu

#### Acting Deputy Director: IPRM, Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (MICT)

Elizabeth Ujarura Kamutuezu highlighted that the Namibian ICT sector is small, but growing rapidly. The Namibian Government has developed numerous laws and policies to create an enabling environment for ICTs to prosper. These laws and policies are aligned with the country's development plans.

The recently-concluded Fourth National Development Plan (NDP 4) recognises ICT as an enabler for economic development, particularly with regards to poverty reduction. Vision 2030 clearly states the goal to achieve a knowledge-based society by 2030. The recent Harambee Prosperity Plan also recognises ICTs as a tool for economic development. Targets set include access to broadband for 80% of citizens, 70 % of the health sector, and 80% of the education sector.

The above shows that citizens are provided access to the Internet and other ICT services. "ICT is a tool for sustainable development, not a consequence of it."

Challenges exist with the affordability of data and the availability of infrastructure, especially in rural areas; these are common regionally and are not unique to Namibia. One has to recognise, Kamutuezu explained, that operators follow a business model, they have to make a profit and upgrading infrastructure comes at a cost. Fees, however, are monitored by regulators and cannot be set arbitrarily high. To bridge the digital divide and support universal access, the Government is planning to make funds available for operators who build infrastructure in rural and remote areas.

Community multipurpose centres should be a link between community radios and the Internet, allowing for information and content to be shared through diverse channels and bridging the information divide between rural and urban residents

residents

CTS AND FIGUR

## a lack of the appropriate infrastructure in rural areas for citizens to make use of these services.

Access must include fast and reliable Internet; e-learning cannot be introduced effectively when there is still

#### Discussion

- If there is 71.3% of Internet coverage, why are only 13% of Namibians online? The number of Internet users should be increased before it can have a significant influence on development. For instance, despite the Office of the Ombudsman having a website and ICT facilities, there is still the need to go to people physically because they do not have access to ICTs.
- Another issue is the lack of availability of relevant information or lack of awareness on what, how and where information is accessible.
- There is a desperate need for up-to-date statistics on connectivity and Internet access. The MICT is now working with the NSA to have data collected. Is has to be ensured that this is done by reliable institutions which provide information that reflects the reality on the ground.
- Access to information as a right is not enough in this day and age; there is also a need for an explicit right to the Internet. A former Minister once made an announcement that free access to Internet will be provided to every school in the country but this has yet to be realised.
- The main challenge to e-learning is a lack of computer skills among teachers. As there is a need to upgrade teacher skills, Unesco partnered with the University of Namibia (Unam) to provide teachers with computer literacy skills, and created a platform where teachers can share ideas.

#### Namibia has:

- Mobile penetration of over 100%;
- 74.5% digital terrestrial television (DTT) coverage;
- 71.3% of the population have access to the Internet of which 53% have access to broadband;
- 78% of Namibians have access to radio, which is a critical tool for information dissemination;
- 143 postal offices countrywide have moved away from unused traditional services to increasingly function as a facility where citizens can access information; and
- MICT has 26 community multipurpose centres in the major town in all regions, even in some remote areas.

## SESSION II: The role of the Internet in achieving youth empowerment in Namibia

Moderator: Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia)

> The youth are often disenfranchised, and may feel they have few avenues to express themselves. Since the Internet is an important element in urban youth culture, as well as significant in the lives of rural youth, it offers opportunities to achieve youth empowerment. The panel discussed how the Internet can aid youth, through communication and access to information, thereby building their social capital and capacity. How can the youth be included in sustainable development and the digital economy? How do we mobilise, empower and inspire the youth to take advantage of the Internet, data applications and mobile technology for self-development, business incubation and entrepreneurship?

> "The youth are the citizens of the Internet," the youth makes up the majority of Namibia's population and therefore need to be included in discussions on Internet governance and sustainable development processes.

#### Lot Ndamanomhata

Board Member of the National Youth Council/ Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare

For the youth to be able to take full advantage of ICT services and developments, it is vital to bridge the digital divide, this will facilitate equal access to e-learning programmes and othe tools relevant to this group. A digital divide exists between urban and rural youth, as well as a general divide in access to information due to a lack of national guarantees for the right to access to information. For the youth to be able to take full advantage of ICT services and developments, it is vital to bridge the digital divide, this will facilitate equal access to e-learning programmes and other tools relevant to this group. The Internet can be used for youth empowerment, if it is made available to all. Additionally, the youth needs to be empowered with information on their rights, opportunities available to them, matters that directly affect them, and how to participate in decision-making processes on these matters.

There are no data initiatives in Namibia, which makes it very difficult for the public to get hold of relevant factual information.

will facilitate equal access to e-learning programmes and other tools relevant to this group

Without an access to information law, officials can refuse to grant access to public information on the grounds that clear regulations on which information can or has to be made available are non-existent.

#### Eben Haihambo

#### Head of Digital Marketing, New Media Admarketing

First one has to consider challenges for youth empowerment in general, not only with regard to the Internet, but also other factors such as access to health, education, communication and youth representation in government. In order to make effective use of the Internet one has to look at what opportunities the Internet provides with regard to these challenges.

With the vast amount of knowledge and information available online the Internet presents an opportunity for access to skills and business for the youth. For instance, YouTube offers tutorials in various subjects and on several topics. Entrepreneurial skills can be acquired and one can grow and exhibit businesses online. Limited access to information and access to ICTs however, restrict the youth's ability to access those opportunities.

If children are given skills and training in technologies, it will provide them with a great head start in live.

#### Gabriel Nhinda Lecturer, University of Namibia (UNAM) / ISOC Namibia

Social media offers numerous opportunities for the youth. Nhinda himself encourages his students to not only meet physically but to also make use of online platforms which can make arranging meetings and group discussions easier.

There is an increase in initiatives aimed at making offline content available and widely accessible to rural communities. Nowadays, skills such as computer skills, social media skills and graphic design skills become increasingly necessary to acquire. Children need to be given options of what to learn, enabling them to choose subjects of interest and excel in them.

Acquiring a myriad of skills through available programmes, trainings and classes children are equipped for the future to generate an additional income for themselves, in times of economic recession or when they are unable to secure an adequately paying job in their primarily learned profession. "Social media enables the youth to create social capital and capacity."

Despite the digital divide, it is important that the youth who have access to the Internet engage in creating a safe and neutral space which will also benefit those who will receive online access in the future.

#### **Petrine Henock**

#### Team Namibia/Namibia Women in Encryption

The question we should asked ourselves is not whether the Internet can be used to empower the youth, but rather how can we utilise the Internet to empower youth. There are a lot of opportunities available in Namibia, with several societies and groups offering free trainings/education introducing new technologies. The youth needs to be educated and encouraged to make use of available resources.

It is also imperative to make use of already existing resources and build upon them, instead of launching new projects and initiatives in isolation, which will consequently be less fruitful.

The youth need access to training in tech and coding as well as on how to use cheap technology to stimulate and achieve youth empowerment and make better use of resources already available.

#### Discussion

- There is a lack of relevant, technology-related education in high schools, students are rarely familiarised with computers, the Internet, basic coding, etc.
- Teaching certain subjects in local languages will only be effective if terms and technical jargon are developed (or existent) in the local language that capture the essence of what is taught, e.g. appropriate translation of scientific terms.
- The research conducted in Namibia is not always up to standard.
- Youth should participate in structural reforms and transformation in society. Awareness-raising initiatives on pertinent issues targeting national youth should therefore be conducted.
- Social media should be used to engage with the youth on important policy matters and to consult them
  on issues of national interest, especially those that affect them directly.
- What responsibility do stakeholders have to mentor and equip the youth with the necessary knowledge and who needs to take responsibility to train the youth?
- It is not about what we know but about awareness on where and how to access knowledge and information.
- There is a lot of potential and innovation coming from young people; this needs to be encouraged and supported without undermining them.
- The youth needs to take responsibility for their own empowerment and make use of the opportunities available to them. Those who have access to technical devices and ICTs should take responsibility to share this with those less fortunate.
- It is our collective responsibility to teach everyone we know about technology.

Social media enables

the youth to create social

capital and capacity

## **SESSION III: Women, girls and the Internet**

Moderator: Natasha Tibinyane ACTION Coalition

> Women and girls in the developing world are significantly less likely to have Internet access than men. Women, and girls in particular, are targets of cyber harassment and violence across a range of online platforms, leading to mistrust and retreat from the web. Women are thus less likely than men to express controversial views online. The panel explored how to tackle gender divides and boost the use of ICTs to promote the empowerment of women and girls on and offline. Panelists also discussed which cultural conditions affect the use of the Internet and how these can be mitigated.

#### Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia)

Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale outlined her first experiences online; finding people with shared interests all over the world through online forums and being able to communicate with them and form friendships, despite the physical distance.

If women and girls are prioritised in the Internet space, they will eventually be enabled to meaningfully participate in this space, including participating in Internet governance decision-

making processes.

The Internet governance space provides a platform for women to discuss policies and regulations, as well as whether women's interests are addressed and how to better address them. Additionally, it is important that efforts are being made to cover women's issues and provide online information that is relevant to girls and women.

Women are often greater affected by the challenges that limit access to the Internet, such as affordability, missing infrastructure and access to mobile devices.

If women and girls are prioritised in the Internet space, they will eventually be enabled to meaningfully participate in this space, including participating in Internet governance decision-making processes.

#### Alisa Amupolo CEO of PowerCom

Alisa Amupolo outlines that in Namibia, both girls and boys make use of social media platforms. Often because of tradition, boys are usually given more possibilities with regard to accessing opportunities and benefitting from them. Although girls are increasingly starting to explore the Internet space, there is however no data available outlining the percentage of male/female users in Namibia. Previously the Internet was predominantly a male space, yet these days, online content

from and for females is becoming more prominent.

Feature phones with Internet access, which are cheaper than smartphones, can eliminate some of the barriers to access, which is especially relevant for the African market.

Equality in access to the Internet is a matter of education, economic empowerment and human rights empowerment.

#### Emma Teofelus

#### Youth Activist / Law Student

Emma Teofelus, who was part of the 2015 UNICEF Consultation on Child Online Protection, noted that many girls seem to experience cyber bullying or cyber harassment, at a significantly higher rate than boys.

Girls are often under scrutiny for their looks or inappropriate advances are made towards them online. This underlines the difference in behaviour of the online community towards girls/women and boys/men. Online behaviour may become an extension of offline behaviour but in an amplified manner, e.g. more aggressive. The impact of bullying and harassment online is the same or worse (given its potential publicity and reach) as offline, making it worrisome that online harassment is often done in extreme ways.

Additionally, there is little education for girls on how to react to online assault.

In order to encourage the urban youth with access to the Internet to advocate for improved access for their fellow citizens who are less privileged, interactions between urban and rural youth should be facilitated through various platforms.

#### Vida de Voss Director of Sister Namibia

Sister Namibia distributes sanitary pads to rural girls so that they do not have to miss school for several weeks a year due to their inability to afford sanitary products. Vida de Voss explains that social media became gradually more important in raising awareness on SisterPADS.

De Voss stressed that people have increasingly similar offline and online experiences; the two experiences feed into each other. For instance, if a girl lacks information on how to access available services offline, she will most likely lack access to this information online as well. Empowerment should therefore be done off- and online.

The Namibian women's movement should better connect to enhance the use of available resources and potential. Groups have to come together, exchange their information and experiences, evaluate their activities and make concerted efforts to address issues that affect them. When working together, common agendas can be pursued and advanced more effectively.

#### Betty Sibeso Editor of Monochrome

When growing up, Betty Sibeso was not introduced to the possibility of creating and sharing her own local content. She and her partner have since launched their 100% Namibian online magazine, after being unable to secure sufficient funds to go into print. Their blog has become increasingly successful internationally and has led to them launching their own website. Sibeso exemplifies that young girls should be encouraged to venture into non-traditional careers.

Throughout her media career, Sibeso has exclusively advertised online and on social media which proved to be an extremely successful strategy and underscores the potential of online platforms to drive business growth.

Namibia should take measures that to improve the digital business environment to ensure that platforms provide benefits to businesses and consumers.

It is vital to have better (online and offline) platforms for women entrepreneurs which provide increased exposure and through which products and services can be shared, and innovations and successes can be celebrated. Young girls should be encouraged to venture into non-traditional careers.

Digital platforms have the potential to drive business growth

## **SESSION IV: Growing the Namibian digital economy**

#### Moderator: Graham Hopwood

Director of the Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR)

Digitisation and the Internet of Things (IoT) provide opportunities to businesses, consumers and citizens, and are transforming business models, policy landscapes and social norms. The digital economy is becoming more intertwined with the general economy around the world. But what is the digital economy and why should Namibia secure and grow it? Can a digital economy bring Namibia closer to achieving its national development goals? How does the digital divide affect the digital economy? How can Namibia cultivate a shared, trusted digital environment that is a driver of inclusive economic development and social advancement?

#### **Bob Ochieng**

#### Stakeholder Engagement Manager, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)

We have to give ourselves a chance to develop African products and services and to allow for trial and error. ICANN is a private, non-profit corporation responsible for IP address space allocation, protocol parameter assignment, domain name system management, and root server system management functions.

In the previous sessions, infrastructure, cost, content, quality of access, and awareness were discussed. These are the basic obstacles faced by countries across the continent.

One of the biggest consumers in any economy is the government. What does that mean from the point of entrepreneurship when talking about growing the Namibian digital economy? With government keeping certain information confidential, the data government holds is often of significant importance for entrepreneurs. Therefore, governments should be encouraged to open up data for the public to access, which will directly contribute to advancing the digital economy. Governments should develop data protection laws that will regulate how data is collected, stored and used, including personal data. The establishment of an enabling legal framework would allow for opening up data, while protecting personal and confidential data.

'African made' products and services are not embraced by Africans. We have to give ourselves a chance to develop African products and services and to allow for trial and error. If local products and services cannot be sold locally then there is little incentive for local production and innovation.

#### Sepo Lamaswala Haihambo

#### RMB Namibia/ First National Bank (FNB)

Issues to be considered should include: how can we revisit at existing structures to put new systems in place and manage disruptions in a digital age.

Mobile technology is transforming the banking industry by making it easier for citizens to send and receive money and manage their accounts. Mobile banking has spread rapidly throughout the country.

There is a cost for developing new platforms; the cost is shared between the commercial institutions making the initial investment and the consumers who use the services.

Financial solutions which have been rolled out have managed to increase financial inclusivity to people that previously did not have access to financial services. Easier means are now available to send money to people living in rural areas, where they would not have access to a branch of one of the local banks. These people now have some kind of storage mechanism and are able to transfer value between people in the community.

There is a need for investment in the infrastructure across the board. Businesses around the world have understood that in order to stay relevant to the consumer base, digitalisation is key. We have to try to bring the public and private sectors more in sync in terms of digitalisation to extract maximum value.

#### Tatenda Malunga Business Analyst, Green Enterprise Solutions

The evolving digital economy is related to emerging technologies which can be leveraged to better provide services and products to Namibian citizens; including the Internet of Things, business analytics and prescriptive analytics. Namibia, and the hospitality sector in particular, is increasingly making use of the benefits and advantages of the Internet.

E -commerce options are available to Namibians but many citizens still do not fully trust using their banking details to purchase products online.

"Technology is no longer merely a business agenda it has become a business core function." With that in mind, Namibia is taking some important steps in realising the digital economy. The Harambee Prosperity Plan includes effective governance, accountability, transparency, e-governance which all play a pivotal role in strengthening Namibia's digital economy.

#### **Discussion:**

- The establishment of an access to information law to change the current culture to a culture of openness with established systems that facilitate open data and access to information.
- So far, consumers are bearing the costs of technological innovations as part of the digital economy, which discourages many to use these technologies, e.g. digital transactions which incur additional fees. Those costs are not helping the growth of the digital economy in Namibia.
- The question has to be asked, what is the skill set that we need in a Namibian context to advance the digital economy? In doing so, these skills should be developed to enable Namibians to design digital solutions that are appreciated by the public and are relevant in the Namibian context. "As a country, we are best placed to solve Namibian problems using digital solutions."
- Where is Namibia with regards to providing blockchain technologies as a way of securing data? Blockchain does not store data on a central server but across vast networks of computers that constantly check and verify information with each other, providing more security for data.
- There must be investment to be able to analyse data and use it effectively.
- As a consequence of the existing digital divide in Namibia technologies are less accessible to the rural population, who cannot benefit from the growth of the digital economy in the same way as the urban population. What can be done to address this?
- Possible downsides of digital economy for traditional businesses/ways of doing things: with people being able to access information online, some businesses may restrict access through registration etc.
- Currently there are no frameworks in place to protect private data. The Namibian Government intends to have data protection laws in place; a data protection bill is being drafted.
- During the process of drafting laws, the capability to enforce these laws also needs to be built to be able to benefit from the legislation.
- Angel investors/venture capitalists not banks are the best entities to invest in start-ups.
- FinTechs: computer programs and other technology used to support or enable banking and financial services.
- In 2015, the African Union (AU) adopted a Convention on Cybersecurity and Personal Data Protection. For this declaration to become operational, at least 15 countries would need to sign and ratify the Convention; so far, only 8 countries have done so.

Technology is no longer merely a business agenda it has become a business core function

## **SESSION V: Cybersecurity in the Namibian context**

Moderator: Max Weylandt Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR)

> Every time we connect to the Internet, we make decisions that affect our cybersecurity. Sophisticated cyber actors and nation states exploit vulnerabilities to steal information and money and are developing capabilities to disrupt, destroy, or threaten the delivery of essential services. The panel will explore the cyber security legal and policy framework; cyber security/ safety online in relation to the citizen, government, business, civil society and the media. Child online protection, securing data, types of cybercrime, and how to respond to growing online threats will also be discussed.

#### Chief Inspector Ratjindua Tjivikua NamPol Cybercrime Unit

The Namibian Police established the Cybercrime Investigation Subdivision or Cybercrime Unit in 2013; the team of four is headed by Chief Inspector Tjivikua. The Unit is based in Windhoek and plans to expand to other regions in the near future. At present, there are no national laws guiding the division; the Electronic Transactions and Cybercrime Bill, which was drafted 15 years ago, has not yet been tabled in Parliament. The lack of a legal framework makes it difficult for law enforcement to investigate and pursue cybercrimes. The public is insufficiently educated on online risks and how to protect itself from threats.

The Cybercrime Unit only has limited recourses and funds at their disposal, which is an impediment to the proper functioning of the Unit; necessary equipment needed to effectively fight cybercrimes is expensive. The division is engaging with other stakeholders and institutions on common issues and challenges.

## law enforcement to<br/>investigate and pursueDr. Paulus Sheetekela<br/>University of Namibia (UNAM)

Dr. Paulus Sheetekela is part of the process of establishing a Computer Incidence Response Team (CIRT) which is supposed to coordinating responses to cyber-attacks occurring in Namibia.

A master's degree programme in cybersecurity is being developed at UNAM to capacitate graduates to develop effective solutions for cyber risks and threats.

"The use of the Internet has brought opportunities but has also made us vulnerable to cyberspace threats." There is a need for protection from these threats in the form of legal provisions. Such laws should be drafted locally, reflecting Namibian realities and needs.

#### Dr Fungai Bhunu Shava

#### Namibia University of Science and Technology (NUST)

In 2013, NUST conducted a fact-finding mission in consultation with industry- and state departments to establish whether there is a need for cyber protection in Namibia. As a result, the creation of an undergraduate degree in cybersecurity and computer science, two honours programmes, one in information security, and another in computer science and digital forensics was envisaged. Information security and digital forensics are also offered at Master's level, and a PHD programme in cybersecurity is in its fourth year.

NUST offers basic cybersecurity training and works with NamPol in an effort to capacitate the Cybercrimes Unit.

The university is also involved in community projects, such as the Child Online Protection Project, which visited five regions to establish the extent of exposure to online risks and threats among young children, aged 13-17.

A cluster focusing on digital forensics and information security research has produced over 30 publications in the past 3 years.

The lack of a legal framework makes it difficult for law enforcement to investigate and pursue cybercrimes. With cybercrimes increasingly being addressed in Namibia, including online attacks on and abuse of minors, there is an urgent need to adopt legislation which offers victims recourse and effectively addresses online criminal activities.

#### Frederico Links ACTION Coalition

The ACTION Coalition, which focuses on the fundamental rights of access to information and freedom of expression, looks at cybersecurity from a human rights perspective, a perspective which is unfortunately missing from the national online security debate. Cybersecurity legislation should protect the right to privacy, the free flow of information and freedom of expression and should not be used to undermine these fundamental rights or suppress political opposition and democracy activists.

Yet, governments in several African countries curtail online free speech by applying laws in a restrictive manner and by shutting down the Internet and other telecommunications services during elections or protests. These developments call for an increased involvement of civil society Continental and regional in Internet rights discussions.

In its current form, the Electronic Transactions and Cybercrime Bill, which has been open to post-drafting consultations, "introduces human rights infringing components and contains unconstitutional elements", it should therefore not be passed. Such legislation should be produced by means of a multistakeholder process, allowing for wide participation and input from diverse sectors from the onset.

#### **Discussion:**

- The Electronic Transactions and Cybercrime Bill was initially withdrawn because of the lack of
  - consultation following democratic principles; the text was opened up for public consultation. Stakeholders have been invited on several occasions to participate in consultations discussing the draft. Comments submitted are being taken into consideration.
- It is necessary to have very clear definitions of the meanings of cybercrime and cybersecurity.
- There is a need for technical education, awareness raising and distribution of relevant information.
- The public school curriculum covers ICTs and cybersecurity issues.
- When talking about security, one should also consider basic issues such as SIM card registration.
- Forms of cybercrimes: 1. Where the device is a target (e.g. computer viruses); 2. Where a device is used as a weapon (e.g. hacking); 3. When a device is used as an accessory to a crime (e.g. downloading copyrighted content illegally).
- "No law is better than a bad law." Victims of cybercrimes, for instance someone who has experienced cyber bullying, have recourse under the common law, meaning there are ways to deal with those crimes while a proper law is in the process of being drafted. "We need legislation, but we need to do it properly. The current law is not a good law and it is not going to help us."
- There is a lack of information on cybercrime related issues.
- Panellists and attendees expressed the need to separate the Bill and have a standalone electronic transaction law and a cybercrime law.
- ICANN offers training to law enforcement on domain abuse.
- Cybersecurity affects us all, we are all potential victims of cybercrimes and therefore need to come together and work together to ensure our safety.
- "The Internet is an inherent multistakeholder platform," hence when we regulate this space it requires multistakeholder participation.

Continental and regional developments call for an increased involvement of civil society in Internet rights discussions

# FILM LAUNCH EVENT: "Implementing Access to Information in Africa: Moving Forward Together."

#### **Presented by Sara Brombart**

#### Director, fesmedia Africa of the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung

On the eve of the International Day on Universal Access to Information (IDUAI), fesmedia Africa of the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung presented the film "Implementing Access to Information in Africa: Moving Forward Together."

So far 21 African countries have adopted specific access to information legislation. The film provides guidance for the effective implementation of the right to information in African countries. It highlights the necessity for a country to consider the following elements to be able to develop a concrete implementation action plan:

- 1. Create an enabling environment for the right to information, including a conducive legal framework.
- 2. Create public awareness and demand for information.
- 3. Consider and budget for ensuring that national institutions have the capacity to deal with making information accessible and handling requests in line with the law.
- 4. Consider effective and sustainable procedures and structures for oversight how to monitor progress and encourage or enforce compliance.

## OPENING SESSION: DAY II (International Day for Universal Access to Information

#### Message from Ms Irina Bokova

Director -General of UNESCO on the occasion of the International Day for Universal Access to Information, delivered by Dr. Jean Pierre Ilboudo, UNESCO Representative to Namibia

n a globalising world, access to information is vital to build more inclusive, sustainable and knowledgeable societies. This is the message of the International Day for Universal Access to Information (IDUAI), which focused on the key role that access to information plays in taking forward the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

Access to information is a fundamental right. It allows people to understand and participate in creating and sharing the knowledge they need to contribute fully to society. It is a condition of informed citizenship, helping to hold governments accountable. It is a driver of innovation and creativity, widening opportunities for all, especially for girls and women.

Being informed starts with the commitment of governments to develop, promulgate and enforce policies and laws on the right to information to guarantee respect for this human right. This requires efficient implementation mechanisms and a culture of transparency across all types of institutions. Citizens need to have the critical thinking, literacy and digital skills required to access, analyse and use information in different ways, offline and online. This is why UNESCO calls on all governments and partners to leverage the power of information and communication technologies to help achieve Sustainable Education Goal 4 for ensuring "inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all." Access to Information is also about promoting development of content that will be relevant, local and multilingual. All of this calls for proactive polices and strong partnerships at all levels.

The International Day for Universal Access to Information is also an opportunity to renew our commitment to freedom of expression and the safety of journalists. The media play a crucial role in facilitating access to information to citizens and in monitoring important social issues while enlightening their audiences with insight and knowledge. There cannot be universal access to information without free and independent media.

Access to information is not only a goal in itself, it is also a key contributor to the realisation of all Sustainable Development Goals. It is therefore crucial that we continue our efforts to ensure that every woman and man enjoy full access to information.

#### Keynote address by John Walters Ombudsman of Namibia

G ood governance is generally defined as "transparent and accountable management of human, natural, economic and financial resources for the purposes of equitable and sustainable development" (2000 Cotonou Convention). The fundamentals of good governance are, amongst others, transparency and accountability. Transparency allows for meaningful analysis of government's actions from the outside. Accountability is based on the idea that people have the right to hold government answerable for its failures and credit it for its successes—it rests on knowledge and information and is therefore dependent on government's transparency. Public authorities hold information "as custodians of the public good" and every person has the right to access this information. "Information is thus the currency of transparency."

Namibia does not have a constitutional right to access to information but is compelled to adopt an access to information law which will "enhance the free flow of information to citizens in order to influence government's policies by debating its decisions." This will eventually lead to greater transparency and accountability and enhance democracy. Putting the responsibility for the operation of an access to information law in the hands of the Ombudsman "will bring about a convergence of access to official information and an independent

not only a goal in itself, it is also a key contributor to the realisation of all Sustainable Development Goals. review of official's administrative conduct." Access to information legislation would greatly improve "the effectiveness of the Ombudsman's role in enhancing transparency."

Access to information legislation would greatly improve the effectiveness of the Ombudsman's role in enhancing transparency.

Non-responsiveness in the public administration is linked to a culture of secrecy in public institutions. This culture of secrecy needs to be replaced by a culture of openness which facilitates a responsive administration.

The adoption of legislation however, does not guarantee the effective implementation of laws or their contribution to accountability in themselves. "The real work with regard to freedom of information laws begins with implementation." Implementation relies on "a multitude of factors," namely, the availability of resources, the capacity of public officials and citizens and an attitudinal change of society.

It is necessary to first "do the groundwork" and create an environment conducive to the right to information and the implementation of such a right. Currently, in Namibia, accessing information can be cumbersome and without a law, citizens have few options of recourse when their right to access to public information is denied.

The NamIGF as a platform for discussion, exchange of knowledge and best practices can inform and inspire national decision-making and shape policy-making processes.

## LAUNCH EVENT: Launch of the 2017 MISA Transparency Assessment in Namibia

#### **Presented by Natasha Tibinyane**

Since 2009, the Media Institute of Southern Africa (MISA) has evaluated the level of openness of government and public institutions in its annual Transparency Assessment. Carried out by MISA Chapters together with local researchers, the study seeks to establish the ease or difficulty with which citizens can access public information.

The study assesses whether public institutions proactively make relevant information available via an online presence in the form of a website or social media accounts. It further evaluates to what degree information is made available to citizens upon request.

Every year, on 28 September, MISA joins the international community in commemorating the International Day for Universal Access to Information. MISA marks the occasion by:

- The regional launch of the MISA Transparency Assessment
- The celebration of national Golden Key and Golden Padlock awards ceremonies

In Namibia, the 2017 research underlined that:

- Government has on numerous occasions expressed its intention to pass an
- access to information law before 28 September 2017, but has failed to do so.
  Several "secrecy laws" which limit citizens' ability to access information, need to be repealed.
- A Cabinet directive adopted in 2016 gives preferential treatment to two state media houses for the dissemination of government information and advertisements.

Assessing eight government and public institutions the national researcher noted that: "Requesting information as an average citizen was mostly frustrating as the majority of institutions were unwilling to respond. Some public bodies acknowledged receipt of the request, but did not respond with the actual information. Other institutions however, seemed happy to provide helpful answers, swiftly and eagerly. These institutions give hope to a brighter future for access to information in Namibia."

The recipient of the 2017 Golden Key Award, in acknowledgement of the institution's efforts to disclose information to the public, is the Communications Regulatory Authority of Namibia (CRAN). Institutions Assessed

- 1. Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare (MPESW)
- 2. Ministry of Environment and Tourism (MET)
- 3. Ministry of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development (MTI)
- 4. Namibia Financial Institutions Supervisory Authority (NAMFISA)
- 5. Communications Regulatory Authority of Namibia (CRAN)
- 6. Namibia Statistics Agency (NSA)
- 7. Electoral Commission of Namibia (ECN)
- 8. Ministry of Justice (MoJ)

In Namibia, requesting information as an average citizen was mostly frustrating as the majority of institutions were unwilling to respond.

## **SESSION VI: Access and Affordability**

#### Moderator: Professor Nixon Ochara

Professor in the Department of Informatics, NUST

Panellists discussed the connection between affordability and access, and whether universal access is a realistic goal for Namibia. What are the barriers to a digitally inclusive society, and where are we in regard to national and international targets on access? Does the legal and policy framework promote content creation and dissemination by protecting freedom of expression, and using technology to promote openness and transparency? Are we striking a balance between net neutrality and business model innovation in providing content? Are there targeted initiatives for underserved groups such as women, farmers, youth, rural residents, and the disabled? "Development is the freedom of individuals to live the lives they want."

#### Anna Amoomo Internet Society (ISOC) Namibia Chapter, Student

Affordability should not only be looked at from a financial point of view but also in terms of the response rate and quality: how long does it take to receive information, is the information received up to date, relevant and reliable? "In Namibia 'local' content is not always produced by locals;" content is often produced by foreign researchers and production companies, which means that information is presented from or influenced by an outside perspective.

Access to quality Internet is limited outside the capital city, this is one factor restricting ICT accessibility for a wide

range of people.

An end-user is anyone who is not an Internet service provider and makes use of the Internet; whether he/she works for an Internet provider or not, can be defined as an end-user. The Internet has the potential to make access to information faster and easier. However, internet packages are expensive, "you have to dig deep in your pocket and that depth will determine the quality," e.g. speed of the Internet connection. Minimum contract length is also a limiting factor. There are however, special packages for students and start-ups.

#### accessibility for a wide Ndahelekwa Paulus Internet Society (ISOC) Namibia Chapter, Office of the Prime Minister

Talking from an end-user perspective Paulus noted that some local institutions make information available on their websites, this facilitates the accessibility of information for some citizens, mainly those living in urban areas. Access to quality Internet is limited outside the capital city, this is one factor restricting ICT accessibility for a wide range of people. Increasing accessibility of rural regions to ICTs and their applications could greatly advance the future development of rural communities and businesses.

#### Melvin Angula

## Head of Universal Access and Services at the Communications Regulatory Authority of Namibia (CRAN)

When people still have to choose between buying data or bread, there is clearly an issue that must be resolved. Access to information and the Internet should be a basic right, like access to water.

Ministers have come to an agreement to make sure that Internet and data should be available at a cost of 5% of people's income. We should look at issues surrounding accessibility and affordability holistically, including prevalent inequalities and the wealth gap.

From the regulatory side Namibia is not yet at a point where we are working on content availability and content provisioning. There is a focus on ensuring that irrespective of the type of service that one gets from operators everyone should adhere to minimum standards; CRAN has established Minimum Quality of Service Regulations. Content should be made available at the same quality and with the same service. At the same time CRAN is careful not to over-regulate this space.

#### **Discussion:**

- Government must invest in putting in place proper infrastructure to improve Internet access. There should be free Internet for everyone in Namibia. It should not be a service that people pay for. Free Internet access would feed into free education, having better access to information and the ability to receive training or gualifications for free online.
- Government welcomes the idea of free Internet but this would have to be a concerted effort and cannot be tackled by government alone. Providing free Internet for the nation would be costly and is currently not possible for the government to realise.
- Access to information and the Internet should be a basic human right and should therefore be free, but if you "want a specific quality associated to that access you should be willing to pay for it." Customers paying a premium price are not receiving premium quality services from internet service providers (ISPs).
- Internet Service Providers (ISPs) need to enter a discussion with end-users facilitated by regulatory bodies and government representatives. ISPs are currently not delivering, which is hampering economic growth.
- Operators have a business goal and need to make a profit, to go to areas where their profit margin will be less than in urban areas they would need to be subsidised for developing the infrastructure and achieve a return on investment.
- One (1) Internet tower costs N\$3 million.
- Rural electrification is dropping instead of increasing and ICTs often rely on electrification.
  - A lot of government institutions are working in silos, e.g. during road constructions fibre cable could simultaneously be pulled to save costs instead of doing this in two steps at different times, as
- is usually the case. In Namibia, development is no longer coming from profits made by businesses, no corporate social investment. Profits are taken out but not reinvested into communities or the country. Policies
- should be developed making local reinvestment a requirement. TV WHITE SPACE: the biggest problem is how to regulate it, who is responsible for the quality of service, what happens when this equipment is deployed, and who is responsible for sustaining the equipment.

- Namibia is unique, having the second-lowest population density (of any sovereign country) in the world: o Measuring approximately 800 000 square kilometres and a population of about 2.5 million.
- 100 percent Internet coverage is the aim, but it is costly.
- It costs about N\$ 8000 to pull a fibre from the main street to one's house (about 7 metres at most).

### SESSION VII: Improving the quality of multistakeholderim in Internet Governance processes in Namibia

#### **Moderator: Eberhard Lisse**

Managing Director of the Namibian Network Information Centre

Sustainable Development Goal 17, which reads: "Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development," recognises multistakeholder partnerships as important vehicles for mobilizing and sharing knowledge, expertise, technologies and financial resources to support the achievement of the sustainable development goals in all countries, particularly developing countries. Today, much of the Internet's infrastructure is operated across borders and by a range of different stakeholders. It is a complex but robust ecosystem where each part of the Internet can rely on many other parts working together but often independently. How can Namibia leverage the multistakeholder approach to foster a sustainable, effective, accountable and transparent IG and policymaking environment?

#### Honourable Faustina Caley, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on ICT and Innovation Member of Parliament

Multistakeholder consultation is crucial during policy-making processes. "Policies must work for the people" and are supposed to serve the community. "Laws are not there to punish people (...) we have to pass laws that will protect the people." Consultation is necessary, lawmakers "cannot afford to work in isolation." As consultation Multistakeholderism Multistakeholderism

Multistakeholderis is a precondition for a successful law making process and should therefore be embraced.

#### Elizabeth Ujarura Kamutuezu

Deputy Director of IPRM in the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (MICT)

The Electronic Transactions and Cybercrime Bill was withdrawn because of a public outcry about insufficient consultation, even though there had been a degree of consultation at that stage. It would be vital for Government to know what, in the public perception, constitutes sufficient consultation. Following the withdrawal of the Bill, an open public consultation process was initiated, leading to the receipt of substantive comments which are currently under consideration to be integrated into the Bill. Multistakeholderism is a precondition for a successful law making process and should therefore be embraced.

#### Frederico Links Chairperson, Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF)

For a democratic law-making process: define pertinent issues that need to be addressed by the law, constitution of a working group, consisting of various stakeholders, which looks at relevant issues with a holistic and inclusive point of view. A group of experts will then look at the identified issues from a technical point of view which will lead to a draft text. The draft law will undergo an open consultation process until a final version will be decided upon.

Currently, in Namibia, civil society is usually "in a reactive position" where it has to respond to already drafted laws and policies instead of being involved in the process from the beginning. Especially regarding complex technology matters, the "real expertise is not in government," therefore technology companies and civil society have to be consulted from the get-go to be able to advise in the early stages of any policy and law-making process, which will also facilitate productive engagement among stakeholders.

#### Nashilongo Gervasius-Nakale Internet Society Namibia Chapter (ISOC Namibia)

Effective policy-making requires all stakeholders to come together to discuss aspects relevant to the implementation of technology-related laws and policies, such as cost, infrastructure, security and human rights. Additionally, there should be a system to monitor and assess the implementation process to guarantee the application and enforcement of laws and policies.

#### Discussion

- All constituencies affected by laws must be engaged, explaining how laws and policies may affect them and how they can get involved in decision-making processes.
- "Before you can get people to engage you must inform" them about the stakes they hold in a certain matter.
- From Government side: calls for participation in public consultation on the Electronic Transactions and Cybercrime Bill were made in the newspaper, with the involvement of governors' offices of all 14 regions to sensitise the people in their region and consult local authorities.
- The "policy process is only for policy-makers in the Ministry" therefore it is not possible to involve outside stakeholders in a policy-making process during its initial stages.
- "Multistakeholderism is not fast but the outcome is more acceptable." It has to be defined what a participatory policy-making process entails.
- It is important to be thorough during policy-making processes to not waste time and resources at a later stage to mend mistakes, withdraw or amend laws or argue about the constitutionality of clauses in court.
- The Combating of Rape Act, 2000, the Combating of Domestic Violence Act, 2003 and the draft Access to Information Bill were developed through extensive consultation processes which resulted in the development of strong laws. "Namibia has proven several times that we can do this and that we can do it right."

## **BUSINESS SESSION**

The participants of the Namibia Internet Governance Forum discussed the structure and identity as well as terms of reference of the NamIGF.

#### **Moderator Bob Ochieng**

#### Stakeholder Engagement Manager, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)

#### **Frederico Links**

#### Chair of the Namibia Internet Governance Forum

- The Ministry of Information and Communications Technology (MICT) initiated the process leading to the first NamIGF.
- Preparatory stakeholders' meetings brought together various stakeholders including representatives of the Access to Information (ACTION) Namibia Coalition, the MICT, ICT Professionals' Association, the Namibian Police, Telecom Namibia, youth advocates, the Communications Regulatory Authority of Namibia (CRAN), Namibia Consumer Trust, the academic community.
- Only few stakeholder groups remained active throughout the planning process which formed an interim organising sub-committee and became the interim NamIGF Working Group.
- If this is going to succeed and in order to receive official recognition, the NamIGF Working Group needs to be formalised and responsibilities have to be distributed.
  - It needs to be a multistakeholder platform with active participation of members.

#### **Discussion:**

Options for the structure of the NamIGF Working Group (WG) / Secretariat:

| Registration as Section<br>21 non-profit company  | Maintain the current<br>NamIGF Working Group<br>and its structure  | Form a Volunteer<br>Association   | Form a Trust  |
|---|--|---|---|
| <ul> <li>Membership-driven</li> <li>Multistakeholder representation</li> <li>Establishment of a board of directors</li> <li>No remuneration/sitting fees for directors</li> <li>Only costs: bank fees for an account opened for the company, annual auditors' fees</li> <li>Able to receive funding</li> <li>No personal liability</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Maintain the interim<br/>team</li> <li>Endorse the current<br/>team to lead the process<br/>of formalising the struc-<br/>ture and institutionalise<br/>the NamIGF</li> <li>Diversify representation</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Able to receive funding</li> <li>Able to open a bank<br/>account</li> <li>Needs a written Consti-<br/>tution</li> <li>Membership-based</li> <li>Trust-based member-<br/>ship</li> <li>None of the members<br/>can be paid for their work</li> <li>Needs to elaborate<br/>on what will happen to<br/>assets if the association<br/>closes down</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>The objectives and<br/>structure of the Trust<br/>must be written in a Deed<br/>of Trust</li> <li>Needs to be registered<br/>with the Master of the<br/>High Court</li> <li>All founders provide<br/>some money to the Mas-<br/>ter<br/>as security (can be ex-<br/>empted)</li> <li>Trust must also hold<br/>some property, even a<br/>small symbolic amount,<br/>when it is first established</li> </ul> |

- Namibian Network Information Centre offered support regarding necessary resources for a Section 21 company.
- Namibia Consumer Protection Group offered its assistance.
- Namibia Media Trust (NMT) is currently responsible for the accounting on behalf of the NamIGF Working Group, since the NMT is also hosting the ACTION WG it would be good to minimise the responsibility for the NMT.
- Namibia Chapter of the Internet Society (ISOC) is willing to host the NamIGF going forward.

#### **Recommendations**:

- Compile a document listing the advantages and disadvantages of different institutional structures.
- Share document with all stakeholders enabling them to reach a final decision on the structure and nature of the NamIGF.
- Committed volunteers who want to become part of the interim Working Group should express their interest.

#### **DRAFT TERMS OF REFERENCE (TORS)**

#### The Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF)

The Namibia Internet Governance Forum (NamIGF) is a multistakeholder forum that engages on issues related to Internet Governance (IG) on a national level, and how it intersects with IG developments at continental, and international level. Established in 2017, it adheres to the principles of the African Internet Governance Forum (AfIGF), which, in keeping with the United Nations (UN) Internet Governance Forum (IGF), strives to:

- Be open all entities, organisations and participating individuals that are IG stakeholders shall be free to join the NamIGF.
- Multistakeholder The active and democratic participation of a diverse range of stakeholders, including that of women and youth, shall be promoted.
- Transparent Stakeholders shall be open in their communication, decisions, and implementation of NamIGF related activities.
- Accountable Mechanisms for checks and balances, as well as for the review and redress of actions related to the NamIGF shall exist.
- Remote participation The NamIGF shall make optimum use of the Internet to increase the number of
  participants in all its activities.

#### The NamIGF's main objectives are to:

- Raise awareness, promote an improved understanding, and build capacity on Internet Governance issues amongst Namibian stakeholders and their respective communities.
- Organise and host an annual multistakeholder and democratic platform for engagement and knowledge-building on Internet Governance related issues in Namibia and beyond.
- Influence the development and implementation of national policies related to the Internet, and broadly, Information and Communication Technology (ICT).
- Facilitate multistakeholder participation by Namibian representatives at continental and global Internet Governance platforms.
- Contribute to the strengthening of multistakeholder engagement on Internet Governance in the Southern African Development Community (SADC) and African Union (AU).

#### The Mandate of the Annual NamIGF is to:

- Discuss public policy issues related to key elements of IG in order to foster the sustainability, robustness, security, stability and development of the Internet in Namibia;
- Facilitate the exchange of information and best practices, and make full use of the expertise of the
  academic, media, human rights and free expression, legal, public as well as the information and
  communication technology (ICT) sectors;
- Make recommendations on how to accelerate the availability and affordability of the Internet in Namibia;
- Identify, highlight and discuss emerging IG issues with stakeholders and the general public, and where
  appropriate, make recommendations;
- Build the capacity of stakeholders on IG, fully drawing on local, continental and international sources of knowledge and expertise;
- · Facilitate solution and consensus building on IG issues that are of particular concern to end-users;
- Publish its proceedings on the Internet.

#### Membership

Membership to the NamIGF is open to all relevant stakeholder groups, representatives and individuals from government, civil society, academia, media, and the ICT sector. Members serve in their personal capacity, but are expected to have extensive linkages with their respective stakeholder groups. The activities of NamIGF shall be coordinated by a Working Group or a Multistakeholder Advisory Group.

The Working Group shall be composed of ten nominated representatives of the NamIGF. The Working Group will have the following responsibilities:

- · Provide administrative, logistical and organisational support to the NamIGF;
- · Promote the activities of the NamIGF and its members;
- · Develop strategies for the sustainability of the NamIGF process in consultation with its members;
- · Act as a management hub for NamIGF activities as well as best practices, knowledge, expertise,
- needs and resources of its members;
- Convene NamIGF meetings;
- Develop and maintain an active email list and a website to provide updated NamIGF-related information;
- Mobilise resources and raise funds.
- The NamIGF shall be led by a Chairperson who will also chair the Working Group.
- The Working Group shall develop an annual work plan for the NamIGF activities.

The NamIGF shall promote the use of discussion forums and other online tools facilitate discussions and exchange of information among its members.

## **FINANCIAL REPORT**

|       | INCOME   | AMOUNT     | COMMENTS                            |
|-------|--|------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1.1.  | Fesmedia Africa  | 145,192.30 | Payments made directly to suppliers |
| 1.2.  | Namibia Media Trust  | 15,000.00  | Amount excludes secretariat support |
| 1.3.  | Internet Governance Support Association                                | 25,700.00  | Donation                            |
| 1.4.  | AFRINIC  | 19,650.00  | Donation                            |
|       | Subtotal   | 205,542.30 |                                     |
|       |  |            |                                     |
|       | EXPENSES   |            |                                     |
| 2.1.  | Conference package: 2 days, Safari Court + equipment rental            | 124,349.41 |                                     |
| 2.2.  | NamIGF generic wall banner   | 8,842.89   |                                     |
| 2.3.  | NamIGF: Director of ceremonies   | 3,000.00   |                                     |
| 2.4.  | NamIGF: Rapporteur   | 12,000.00  |                                     |
| 2.5.  | Facebook advertising costs   | 400.00     |                                     |
| 2.6.  | Daily allowances: 2 x Interns @ 2 days                                 | 2,000.00   |                                     |
| 2.7.  | Local transport for interns  | 260.00     |                                     |
| 2.8.  | NamIGF coordination assistance: Natalie<br>Rowney                      | 4,000.00   |                                     |
| 2.9.  | NamIGF logistics assistance: Emilia Paulus                             | 2,000.00   |                                     |
| 2.10. | NamIGF t-shirts, pop-up banners, lanyards, programmes, vinyl name tags | 19,384.60  |                                     |
| 2.11. | Photography: Johannes Berndalen  | 1,500.00   |                                     |
|       | Subtotal   | 177,736.90 |                                     |
|       | SURPLUS  | 27,805.40  |                                     |